

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 387 912

EA 027 108

AUTHOR Williams, Marium Thomas
TITLE The Mystery of Motivation: A Synthesis of Clues for Its Solution.
PUB DATE Oct 95
NOTE 13p.; Title on cover page is: "The Mystery of Motivation: Staff Development for all School District Personnel."
PUB TYPE Information Analyses (070)
EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Incentives; Job Satisfaction; *Motivation; Motivation Techniques; Organizational Development; *Organizational Theories; *Professional Autonomy; Professional Recognition; Rewards; *Self Motivation

ABSTRACT

Organizational theorists have long pondered answers to the question of how best to move people toward effective purpose. This paper synthesizes literature that focuses on ways to promote autonomy among workers. The autonomous worker chooses practical efficiency and moral responsibility. Findings are listed in the following areas: motivation and autonomy, characteristics of intrinsically motivated people, job satisfaction and motivation, combinations of intrinsic and extrinsic motivators, and extrinsic rewards and motivation. It is recommended that leaders seek alternatives to the extrinsic reward system for their personnel in the schools and workplaces in order to promote productivity and job satisfaction. (Contains 39 references.) (LMI)

* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *

The Mystery of Motivation

Staff Development for all School District Personnel

October 20, 1995

Marium Thomas Williams

503 Ginger Hall

Morehead State University

Morehead Kentucky 40351

606-783-2503

Associate Professor, former MSU Professional Development Coordinator, Phi Delta Kappan
Administrator, School Administrator and teacher.

Articles in Reading Teacher and ERIC.

Typed on Gateway 2000 using WordPerfect 6.0

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION
CENTER (ERIC)

☒ This document has been reproduced as
received from the person or organization
originating it.
☐ Minor changes have been made to improve
reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this docu-
ment do not necessarily represent official
OERI position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS
MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

M. Williams

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)"

**The Mystery of Motivation:
A Synthesis of Clues for its Solution**

Abstract

Knowledge of motivation is essential in planning effective programs that develop all kinds of school personnel.

This study emanates from observations of businesses, schools and industries.

The Mystery of Motivation:

A Synthesis of Clues for its Solution

Bartleby, the Scrivener, (Melville, 1987) literally died in his job. His sole response to his director's work requests had been "I prefer not to". This mystery perplexed his employer who had tried in many ways to readjust Bartleby's schedule, environment and working conditions in an effort to motivate Bartleby. Herman Melville's characters posed a mystery in motivation for readers in the mid-nineteenth century. But one of today's students of motivation, Martin Covington, states in his 1992 book, Making the Grade, "Whatever is being aroused by the clever use of incentives and rewards, namely motivation itself, remains mysterious and elusive" (p.1).

This synthesis of readings is focused on this mystery of motivation and the ancillary issues of intrinsic and extrinsic rewards that may be used as a lever to motivate.

Intrinsic motivation here will allude to those rewards which satisfy the psychological needs of an individual to freely explore, to learn, to create, to grow. (These are the Hertzberg motivators (1966) and the Maslow higher order needs (1970) that relate to self-esteem and self-actualization.)

Extrinsic motivation here will allude to those rewards which satisfy the physiological needs that money can buy. (These are the Hertzberg hygenics [1966] and the Maslow lower order survival and safety needs [1970]).

"What is the best use of these two types of motivators?" is the question. "How best to move people to the effective purposing?" suggested by William Kilpatrick in 1918 is today's question posed by employers, supervisors, principals, superintendents and CEO's in the field

of education and outside of education. This review and literature focuses on ways to promote an individual "who habitually regulates life with worthy social aims, meets at once demands for practical efficiency and moral responsibility...This purposeful act is not the act of a serf or slave" (Kilpatrick, 1981, p. 320).

Indeed, the autonomous worker--the one who chooses practical efficiency and moral responsibility--is the antithesis of a slave. This autonomy is an aspect that often appeared in this synthesis of readings and research on motivation.

MOTIVATION AND AUTONOMY

1. Autonomy is more intrinsically motivating (Deci & Ryan, 1985; Lepper, 1988; Peters & Waterman, 1982).
2. Leaders should not be dictators to promote intrinsic motivation (Joyce & Showers, 1993).
3. Mentors should allow choice to promote intrinsic motivation (Newby, 1992; Brookhart & Loadman, 1992).
4. Involving participants in the planning of professional development promotes autonomous behavior (Wood & Kleine, 1988).
5. Task autonomy and significant involvement are intrinsic motivators (Mottaz, 1988).
6. Partnerships between managers and workers promote intrinsic motivation (Brandt, 1992).
7. Choice promotes intrinsic motivation (Drucker, 1990; Toffler, 1990; Maheady, Sainato & Maitland, 1983; Joyce & Showers, 1993; Seyforth, 1991; Brandt, 1992).

8. Establishing trust fosters intrinsic motivation (Newby, 1992). The rationale here is that offering choice, providing partnerships and autonomy fosters trust.

INTRINSICALLY MOTIVATED PEOPLE

The following researchers and scholars provide us with a strong rationale for wanting to promulgate intrinsically motivated workers and students.

1. Intrinsically motivated people are more likely to accept challenge (Lepper, 1988; Heskett, 1986).
2. Intrinsically motivated people are more creative and productive (Deci & Ryan, 1985; Lepper, 1988; Peters & Waterman, 1983\2).
3. Intrinsically motivated students accrue increased learning effects (Lepper, 1988; Lehman & Geller, 1990; Perleman, 1993).
4. Intrinsically motivated people sustain desired change for a longer period than those motivated extrinsically (Geller, Rudd, Halsher, & Streff, 1987; Berry & Ginsberg, 1990; Mitchell & Peters, 1988).
5. Intrinsically motivated people are free of reinforcement contingencies (Deci & Ryan, 1981; Lepper, 1988; Rummel & Feinberg, 1990).

JOB SATISFACTION AND MOTIVATION

The following researchers and scholars give us some understanding on how jobs can supply the needs of workers so that they find their work satisfying.

1. Intrinsic values increase job satisfaction and committedness (Martin & Shehan, 1989; Mottaz, 1988; Ronen & Sadan, 1984; Ben-Sira, 1986).

2. People have a need to be responsible (Geller, Rudd, Kalsher, & Streff; Page, 1983; Drucker, 1992).
3. People need to feel they are valued (Heskett, 1986).
4. People need to have a sense of achievement (Geller, Rudd, Kalsher, & Streff; Page, 1983; Peters & Waterman, 1992).

MOTIVATORS MIX

Most searches through research and literature will provide the investigator with results that are counter indicators of other finds. Here in Item 1, there is some indication that monetary rewards and status usually defined as extrinsic motivators have intrinsic results. Neither is it surprising in Item 2 that good salaries and benefits are satisfying to the worker as well as the intrinsic motivators listed in the above are also satisfying to the worker.

1. Intrinsic motivation correlates with upper level occupations (Simacha & Simacha, 1984; Ben-Sira, 1986; Ronen & Sadan, 1984).
2. Job satisfaction is related to competitive salaries and attractive benefits (Kanhier & Unruh, 1989; Dubinsky & Levy, 1989; Martin & Shehan, 1989; Skaggs, Dickinson & O'Connor, 1992; Mottaz, 1988; Simcha & Simcha, 1984).
3. School environment offers intrinsic and extrinsic rewards which reinforce the status quo (Goodlad, 1984).
4. People need quick success, rewards or praise to continue to be motivated (Belasco, 1990).
5. Gender differences and attitudes are reflected in intrinsic and extrinsic rewards (Thomas & Shields, 1987; Kanchier & Unruh, 1989; Martin & Shehan, 1989;

Mohpatra, 1990).

EXTRINSIC REWARDS AND MOTIVATION

However, with these conclusions drawn from the research and literature in sources both inside of education and outside of education, a modern day supervisor should not ignore intrinsic motivators. To rely solely on the Fredrick Taylor scientific management paradigm of the late 19th century and early 20th century which focused on extrinsic rewards and physiological accommodations would be a mistake (Hoy & Miskel, 1991).

1. Extrinsic rewards are often effective and necessary for menial and unchallenging tasks (Deci & Ryan, 1985; Mottaz, 1988).
2. Extrinsic rewards may offer a motivational strategy for tasks which threaten egos (Miller & Hom, 1990).
3. Rewards and incentives may be counter productive to job satisfaction (Deci & Ryan, 1985; Lepper, 1988).
4. Evaluation (a prerequisite of a formal reward system) is seen as controlling and decreases intrinsic motivation
5. Extrinsic rewards do not promote self-directed personnel (Mirvis & Hackett, 1983; Kanachier & Unruh, 1989; Maheady, Sainato & Maitland, 1983; Lehmand & Geller, 1990).

The extrinsic reward does not promote the autonomous (self-directing) worker. That statement brings the topic back to the desired worker--one with a disposition to purposefully act--to be efficient and morally responsible. How do we develop such a person? This question is still one which directors of work should continue to study. However, these

directions gleaned from a variety of investigators in a variety of arenas may give leaders means of working with their personnel in the schools and workplaces which will encourage productivity and job satisfaction. There are better investments than the traditional reward systems for the workers and the organization. The mystery of how to develop people to "purposefully act" is not solved, but there are clues here for possible solutions to the mystery of motivation.

References

- Belasco, J.A. (1990). Teaching the elephant to dance. New York: Crown Publishers.
- Ben-Sira, Z. (1986). The plight of primary medical care: The problematics of committedness to practice. Social Science and Medicine, 22 (7), 669-712.
- Berry, B., & Ginzberg, R. (1990). Creating lead teachers: From policy to implementation. Phi Delta Kappan, 71 (8), 616-21.
- Brandt, R. (1992). Improving schools from within. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Brandt, R. (1986). One the expert teacher: A conversation with David Berliner. Educational Leadership, 44 (2), 4-9.
- Brookhart, S., & Loadman, W. (1992). School-university collaboration and perceived professional rewards. Journal of Research in Education, 2 (1), 68-76.
- Covington, M. (1992). Making the grade: A self-worth perspective on motivation and school reform. New York: Cambridge University.
- Deci, E., & Ryan, R. (1985). Intrinsic motivation and self-determination in human behavior. New York: Plenum.
- Drucker, P. (1992). Managing the future. New York: Penguin.
- Drucker, P. (1990). Managing the non-profit organization. New York: Harper Collins.
- Dubinsky, A., & Levy, M. (1989). Influence of organizational fairness. Journal of Retailing, 65 (2), 221-252.
- Geller, E., Rudd, J., Kalsher, J., Streff, F. (1987). Employer-based programs to motivate safety belt use: A review. Journal of Safety Research, 18 (1), 1-17.

- Goodlad, J. (1984). *A place called school: Prospects for the future*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Hertzberg, F., Mausner, B., & Snyderman, B. (1959). The motivation to work. New York: Wiley.
- Heskett, J. (1986). Managing the service economy. Boston: Harvard Business School Press.
- Hoy, W., & Miskel, C.G. (1991). Educational administration: Theory, research, and practice. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Joyce, B., & Showers, B. (1993). Student achievement through staff development. White Plains, NY: Longman.
- Kanachier, C., & Unruh, W. (1989). Occupational change: What makes changes different. Journal of Career Development, 15 (3), 174-187.
- Kilpatrick, W. (1918). The project method. teachers College Record, 19 (4), 319-335.
- Lehmand, G., & Geller, E. (1990). Educational strategies to increase children's use of safety belts: Are extrinsic rewards necessary. Health Education Research, 5 (2), 187-196.
- Lepper, M. (1988). Motivational considerations in the study of instruction. Cognition and Instruction, 5 (4), 289-309.
- Maheady, L., Sainato, D., & Maitland, G. (1983). Motivated assessment: The effects of extrinsic rewards on the individually-administered reading test performance of low, average and high IQ students. Education and Treatment of Children, 6 (1), 37-46.

Martin, J., & Shehan, C. (1989). Education and job satisfaction: The influence of gender, wage earner status, and job values. Work and Occupations: An International-Sociological Journal, 16 (2), 184-199.

Maslow, A. (1970). Motivation and personality (2nd ed.). New York: Harper & Row.

Melville, H. (1987). Bartleby, the scrivener. In H. Hayford, A. MacDougall, G. Transelle (Eds.), The Piazza Tales and other prose pieces, 1839-1860 (pp. 13-46). Evanston, IL: Northwestern University Press.

Mitchell, D., & Peters, M. (1988). A stronger profession through appropriate teacher incentives. Educational Leadership, 46 (3), 30-48.

Miller, A., & Hom, H. (1990). Influence of extrinsic and ego intrinsic value on persistence after failure and continuing motivation. Journal of Educational Psychology, 82 (3), 539-545.

Mirvis, P., & Hackett, E. (1983). Work and workforce characteristics in nonprofit sector. Monthly Labor Review, 106 (4), 3-12.

Mottaz, T.J. (1992). The value of mentoring. Performance Improvement Quarterly, 5 (4), 2-15.

Perelman, L. (1993). School's out. New York: William Morrow.

Peters, T., & Waterman, R. (1992). Thriving on chaos. New York: Harper & Row.

Peters, t., & Waterman, R. (1982). In search of excellence: Lessons from America's best-run companies (2nd ed.). New York: Harper & Row.

Ronen, S., & Sadan, S. (1984). Job attitudes among different occupational status groups: An economic analysis. Work and Occupations: An International Sociological Journal, 11 (1), 77-97.

Rummel, A., & Feinberg, R. (1990). Re-evaluation or reinforcement? A new look at cognitive evaluation. Social Behavior and Personality, 18 (1), 65-79.

Seyforth, J. (1991). Personnel management for effective schools. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.

Skaggs, K., Dickinson, A., & O'Connor, K. (1992). The use of concurrent schedules to evaluate the effects of extrinsic rewards on "intrinsic motivation". Journal of Organizational Behavior Management, 12 (1), 45-83.

Simcha, R., & Simcha, S. (1984). Job attitudes among different occupational status groups. Work and Occupations: An International Sociological Journal, 11 (1), 77-97.

Thomas, V.,m & Shield, L. (1987). Gender influences on work values of black adolescents. Adolescence, 22 (85), 37-43.

Toffler, A. (1990). Power shift: Knowledge, wealth, and violence in the 21st century. New York: Bantam.

Wood. F., & Kleine, P. (1988). Rural staff development research: A small step forward. Journal of Staff Development, 9 (4), 2-5.